

PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE

8th AUGUST, 2019

PRESENT:

Councillor Walsh (In the Chair),
Councillors Dr. Barclay, Bunting, Cordingley, Holden (Substitute), Jerrome, Minnis,
Morgan, Patel, K. Procter, Stennett MBE, Williams and Winstanley.

In attendance: Head of Planning and Development (Ms. R. Coley),
Major Planning Projects Manager (Mrs. S. Lowes),
Major Planning Projects Officer (Mrs. B. Brown),
Planning and Development Officer (Mr. G. England),
Principal Highways & Traffic Engineer (Amey) (Mr. G. Evenson),
Solicitor (Mrs. C. Kefford),
Democratic & Scrutiny Officer (Miss M. Cody).

Also present: Councillors Mrs. Haddad, Harding, Mitchell and Mrs. Young.

APOLOGY

An apology for absence was received from Councillor Carey.

18. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

Declarations made at this point in proceedings were as follows:

Councillor Procter declared a Personal and Prejudicial Interest in Applications 97375/FUL/19 (Hale Bowling Pavilion, Cecil Road, Hale) and 97376/FUL/19 (Hale Library, Leigh Road, Hale) due to his involvement being the former Executive Member for Communities and Housing. He also declared a Personal and Prejudicial Interest in Application 97876/HHA/19 (15 Carrsvalle Avenue, Urmston) as he had previously made representations regarding the site.

Councillor Holden declared a Personal and Prejudicial Interest in Application 97477/FUL/19 (Stretford Grammar School, Granby Road, Stretford) due to him being a Governor of the School.

19. MINUTES

RESOLVED: That the Minutes of the meeting held on 11th July, 2019, be approved as a correct record and signed by the Chair.

20. QUESTIONS FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC

No questions were submitted.

21. ADDITIONAL INFORMATION REPORT

The Head of Planning and Development submitted a report informing Members of additional information received regarding applications for planning permission to be determined by the Committee.

**Planning and Development Management Committee
8 August 2019**

RESOLVED: That the report be received and noted.

22. APPLICATIONS FOR PERMISSION TO DEVELOP ETC

- (a) Permission granted subject to standard conditions prescribed by statute, if any, and to any other conditions now determined

<u>Application No., Address or Site</u>	<u>Description</u>
96825/FUL/19 – 30 and 32 Derbyshire Lane, Stretford.	Application for the use of the site as a proposed care facility for all ages (Use Class C2) and the addition of a side window.

[Note: Councillor Jerrome declared a Personal Interest in Application 96825/FUL/19 as representations had been made in support of the Application by a Trafford Green Party Member and friend; he stated that he was approaching the Application with an open mind and with no preconceptions and that he would listen fully to the debate and carefully weigh up all the relevant planning considerations before making a decision on the matter.]

97375/FUL/19 – Hale Bowling Pavilion, Cecil Road, Hale.	Demolition of existing building, and construction of new multi-functional community building consisting of a new library, bowling club and various flexible functional spaces.
---	--

[Note: Councillor Procter declared a Personal and Prejudicial Interest in Application 97375/FUL/19 due to his involvement being the former Executive Member for Communities and Housing and left the room during consideration of this item.]

97376/FUL/19 – Hale Library, Leigh Road, Hale.	Demolition of existing building, and construction of new build mixed use development, consisting of retail space (Class A1), 6 No semi-detached houses, and 2 No apartments.
--	--

[Note: Councillor Procter declared a Personal and Prejudicial Interest in Application 97376/FUL/19 due to his involvement being the former Executive Member for Communities and Housing and left the room during consideration of this item.]

97477/FUL/19 – Stretford Grammar School, Granby Road, Stretford.	Erection of a single storey extension, reconfiguration of car parking and ancillary works.
--	--

[Note: Councillor Holden declared a Personal and Prejudicial Interest in Application 97477/FUL/19 being a Governor of the school and left the room during consideration of this item.]

Councillor Winstanley declared a Personal Interest in Application 97477/FUL/19 as his children went to the school.

**Planning and Development Management Committee
8 August 2019**

Councillor Jerrome declared a Personal Interest in Application 97477/FUL/19 as representations had been made by a Trafford Green Party Member; he stated that he was approaching the Application with an open mind and with no preconceptions and that he would listen fully to the debate and carefully weigh up all the relevant planning considerations before making a decision on the matter.]

97492/HHA/19 – 5 Cranford Road, Flixton.	Erection of a single storey side and part single, part two storey rear extension. Demolition of existing garage and erection of new garage.
--	---

98056/HHA/19 – 14 Sidmouth Avenue, Flixton.	Erection of single storey rear extension following demolition of existing conservatory.
---	---

(b) Permission refused for the reasons now determined

<u>Application No., Address or Site</u>	<u>Description</u>
97046/FUL/19 – 6-10 Victoria Road, Hale.	Erection of a single storey side extension to encapsulate the existing outdoor terrace area.
97876/HHA/19 – 15 Carrsvale Avenue, Urmston.	Erection of a part single/part two storey side extension.

[Note: Councillor Procter declared a Personal and Prejudicial Interest in Application 97876/HHA/19 as he had previously made representations regarding the site and left the room during consideration of this item.]

23. APPLICATION FOR PLANNING PERMISSION 97607/VAR/19 - SCHOOL DEVELOPMENT SITE, AUDLEY AVENUE, STRETFORD

The Head of Planning and Development submitted a report concerning an application for the variation of conditions 2, 10, 15, 16 on planning permission 94950/FUL/18 (Erection of new SEN school with associated infrastructure including access, parking and landscaping.). To include a 12 no. place nursery within the Orchards SEN Primary School.

RESOLVED: That Members are minded to grant planning permission for the development and that the determination of the application hereafter be deferred and delegated to the Head of Planning and Development to enable the completion of a Deed of Variation in respect of the existing Section 111 Agreement and subject to the conditions now determined.

Planning and Development Management Committee
8 August 2019

ANNOUNCEMENT

96465/FUL/18 - 74 Bankhall Lane, Hale WA15 0LW

It was reported to the Committee that an Appeal decision regarding this site had been received. The planning application proposed a 64 bedroom care home on the site of one dwelling.

It was highlighted that at the May meeting of the Planning and Development Management Committee it was explained that an Appeal against the application's non-determination had been lodged and a report was presented to Members to establish the stance to adopt at the Public Inquiry into the Appeal. The Inquiry, which lasted eight days, took place in June this year.

The Council's case centred around three reasons for refusal, as follows:

- A detrimental impact upon landscape character.
- Harm arising to the adjacent Conservation Area.
- Unjustifiable impacts to protected species.

There were further concerns surrounding the model of care proposed, the lack of need for this type of facility, the site's unsustainable location, the limited garden space and the lack of opportunities for residents to integrate with the community.

The Council put forward five witnesses to defend its case along with a barrister to present the arguments to an independent Planning Inspector; the Applicant did the same. A Local Residents Group also formally participated in the process, complementing the Council's position.

The Inspector's decision was issued on 7th August 2019 and confirmed that the Appeal had been dismissed and that planning permission would not be granted. The Inspector agreed that the proposed development would be damaging to landscape character. In addition, it was accepted that the site has poor access to the local area for prospective residents and that the design and model of care proposed was inappropriate, however, the arguments regarding harm to protected species and to the Conservation Area were not accepted.

Trafford Council's lack of a five year housing land supply was acknowledged by the Inspector and it was accepted that the proposal would make a useful contribution to housing targets. Even so, the Inspector agreed with the Council that, overall, the benefits of the development would be significantly and demonstrably outweighed by the harms. Officers have concluded that the Inspector's position regarding the site's locational shortcomings for future residents is likely to preclude any further proposal for a care home on this site, even if it were reduced in size.

It was stated that Officers have very much welcomed the decision which confirms that new housing should not be accepted at any cost even when the tilted balance is engaged, however, there were a series of accepted material harms in this case.

Planning and Development Management Committee
8 August 2019

Councillor Bunting on behalf of the Committee thanked all Officers involved with the preparation, organisation and attendance at the Public Inquiry, a sentiment that was echoed by other Members of the Committee.

The meeting commenced at 6.30 pm and concluded at 9.00 pm.